EFL HIGH SCHOOL TEACHERS' BELIEFS IN DEVELOPING EMERGENCY REMOTE TEACHING: A NARRATIVE INQUIRY OF EXPERIENCED AND NOVICE TEACHER

Sabrina Nur Azizah
English Education program, FKIP, Universitas Galuh, Ciamis, Indonesia
sabrinanuraziz@gmail.com

Abstract: This study describes experienced and novice senior high school Teachers' Beliefs in developing emergency remote teaching in the Covid-19 pandemic era. This study also aims in investigating teachers' beliefs in developing emergency remote teaching, and to what extent experienced and novice high school teachers' beliefs can be affected by students in Emergency Remote Teaching. The study used a qualitative research design which includes the nature of a Narrative Inquiry depending on participants' experiences. The semi-structured interview with Experienced and Novice English teachers from high school was obtained as participants. The findings showed that teacher beliefs of experienced and novice teachers are not the same and this affects the advance of Emergency remote teaching from each teacher's beliefs. Most importantly, for the experienced teacher, the most important in emergency remote teaching is teachers' strategies to use the available technology to design easy teaching and learning activities for students. In another sense, students become more communicative and enthusiastic about learning. Furthermore, the important thing for the novice teacher is that students can follow class easily using their own background. Accordingly, students could easily learn by means of accessing platforms and providing modules as simply as possible. Based on the result of this study, it is recommended that teachers ought to be better and more creative while teaching and learning. The slightest opportunity to use various platforms is required to develop emergency remote teaching.

Keywords: *classroom development; emergency remote teaching; teacher's beliefs*

INTRODUCTION

The circumstance of the world seemed to be shaken by news about the spread of the virus named COVID-19 (Coronavirus Disease 2019). With its highly contagious nature and adapting quickly to all conditions, the virus can spread quickly and lock everybody down, also regarding government entreaty that is social distancing likewise affected by work, in this study, and in worship at home. In consequence, the education process, conventional or face-to-face techniques, now has been shifted, due to the non-natural COVID-19 disaster, to the online teaching and learning process (on the network).

The development of technology in supporting the teaching and learning process has benefits for Emergency Remote Classes during the Covid-19 Pandemic, as the research from Jimoyiannis, Tsiotakis, & Koukis (2021, p.3) that explains that the pandemic concepts include such as online education in schools, online teaching/learning, and emergency remote teaching was interchangeably employed for educational and public discourse. On the other hand, according to Saadati et al., (2021, p. 9) explain that ICT integration in their teaching practices affects the level of teaching and learning with ICT, teachers beliefs of pedagogical-technological beliefs have a role and are the central factor in it. Therefore, Emergency Remote Teaching (ERT) become one of the determined of classroom activities online. Zhang (2020, p. 36) explained that Emergency

remote teaching (ERT) or consciously all components are forced to transform the internet-based learning process.

On condition implementation this Emergency remote teaching has progress however still needs to be developed, based on research from Cahyadi et al., (2021, p. 4) stated that implementing Emergency Remote Teaching in Indonesia, getting progressively delivery available to as many people as possible is referred to as accessibility. Thus, teachers can select easily accessible application forms and interactive educational media to overcome disparities in the capacities and capabilities of digital devices used by students.

Teachers' beliefs become one of the determinants of success in the development of Emergency remote teaching, teachers will try as much as possible and serves as both an organizer and a facilitator of learning. Teachers' beliefs are urgently needed to ensure the smooth running of the teaching process in the classroom (Nurkamto, Drajati, Ngadiso & Karlina., 2021, p.668), moreover, the teacher's beliefs would affect the development of the learning process in the online class, and it also would be highly affected for the student development in the classroom. It has an impact on towards student's development in the English classroom as stated in Kim (2021, p.4).

Furthermore, Teacher's belief has an impact on learning, and high teacher beliefs are believed to have an impact on the completeness of the implementation of the curriculum and classroom learning, and conversely, low teacher beliefs will lead to low curriculum implementation and classroom learning. Nevertheless, teachers' experiences also effected to the beliefs. Experienced teachers, on the other hand, have a significant impact on classrooms teaching activities since they are familiar with their students' behavior and how to engage them in the classroom, in the fact that experienced teachers had significantly higher overall self-efficacy (Hoekstra et al., 2007, p. 199). According to several international studies, there are many challenges that novice teachers face in adjusting to their new role as professionals that must be overcome (Caspersen & Raaen, 2017, p. 190).

The researchers takes some previous studies that examined teachers' beliefs from Nurkamto et al, 2021; Bai & Yuan, 2019; Roeder & Miller, 2022; & Lan & Lam, 2020. Since online learning has been implemented, regarding various previous studies mentioned before and infrequently studies have investigated the beliefs in Emergency Remote Teaching, especially of experienced and novice teachers, the researchers conducted this research it is intriguing to see how teachers' beliefs in this context. Therefore, this study attempts to examine experienced and novice senior high school teachers' beliefs in developing their teaching activities during online classes, which is currently under revealed in the existing reference.

METHOD

Research Design

This qualitative research uses narrative inquiry design to present experienced and novice high school teachers' beliefs in developing Emergency Remote Teaching. Narrative inquiry is a qualitative method that capturesthe personal and human aspects of lived experiences and portrays them in a narrative format. According to Creswell and Poth (2018, p. 558), the narrative design focuses on the interplay of home and school effects from the teachers' perspectives, to meet the demand forexperiential research.

Participants

The research participant is Experienced and Novice English teachers from high school in Tasikmalaya that used to teach in online classes. The participants were chosen based on

purposively that the sort of knowledge required, which was correlated to their ability to comprehend instructional situations.

Data Collection

In collecting data in this form is to emphasize on the specific types of data and the techniques, the researchers used semi-structured interviews. As suggested by Fraenkel & Wallen, n.d., (2011, p. 15) semi-structured interview gives advantages to the researchers to investigate information deeper. This kind of interview allows the interviewee to clarify any questions that are not clear, and add new questions related to the phenomenon.

In conducting this narrative inquiry, the procedure represented a clear and comprehensive stage including; Firstly, identify the phenomenon that would like to investigate. The researchers can learn about a person's personal or community experiences by identifying a problem or issue (s). Secondly, choose one or more participants to research. Thirdly, gather participant stories. The researchers used semi-structuredinterviews as suggested by Fraenkel & Wallen, n.d., (2011, p.5), the semi-structured interview gives advantages to the researchers to investigate information deeper. Fourthly, retell the individual's experiences. Fifthly, collaborate with the storyteller/participant. During the narrative story collection technique, the researchers interacts with the storyteller to ensure thatthe participant's experiences are accurately recorded. Sixthly, summarize the findings of participants' experiences. The findings were reported after the researchers used thematic analysis.

Data Analysis

Analyzing the data in this context the research brief is commissioned. Aims and objectives are highly highlighted and the researchers work with organized topic guidelines to show patterns in the data (Smith et al., 2011, p.5). In analyzing the data, the researchers conducted two steps of analysis.

The first was the interview data based on Creswell and Poth (2018) research state that Practical guidance in the systematic analysis of interview transcripts is beneficial for obtaining themes common to multiple interviews or unique to a single interview and then generating a conceptual link, which was held in these procedures, they are: firstly, listening to the audio of interviews as a whole. Secondly, transcribing the interviews. Thirdly, codding the data. Fourthly, classifying the data to some categories. And fifthly, summarizing.

In addition, the second phase is to analyze the materials linked to the story,which the researchers conduct before producing narratives. Written transcripts wereutilized to identify distinct text segments describing a particular event or experiencethat the participants discussed

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Findings

This Findings explains the qualitative data which was obtained from the participant's experiences who are experienced and novice teachers, and answered regarding to the topic about teachers' beliefs in developing emergency remote teaching in the covid-19 pandemic era. The researchers described the research result in the following organization:

What are teachers' beliefs in developing Emergency remote teaching?

In collecting the data to the participants, the researchers conducted semi-structured interview session to the EFL high school teachers. There are around 8 questions in the interview session. In the teaching and learning activities, experienced teachers and novice teachers must have

their own beliefs in enhancing the learning quality for their students. Moreover, in teaching and learning activities that are implemented online, various new things must be explored by teachers because Emergency remote teaching is something unfamiliar in schools, from the data obtained, there are differences in beliefs between experienced and novice teachers in Emergency remote teaching.

From the first participants, Experienced teacher, the most important thing in carrying out online teaching and learning activities is new strategies, and how to prepare a more effective way of delivering material through existing technology that certainly easy to understand and all students can access it easily. The delivery of material through technology was a new thing for him he also had to find new ways and strategies for Emergency remote teaching. On the other hand, in emergency remote teaching the experienced also mentioned regarding the differences in how the strategies and ways of delivering the material that teachers used, he stated that using existing technology and adapting it to the situation of students is important and must be prioritized because he also believes that if the teacher used diverse technology, it will make his students more enthusiastic in carrying out teaching and learning activities. Fortunately, he only had to give his best in the preparation, giving, and delivery of material for the development of his students during the teaching and learning process, and in the current conditions that are prioritize must be the needs of students, what students should get in Emergency remote teaching.

The belief in Emergency remote teaching students are the main target, regardless of the learning conditions, students must still get knowledge they should get, so it is the task of a teacher who must find strategies and ways how students to get effective learning online just like when doing learning in class. But there are things that he also lacks confidence in this Emergency remote teaching, where he is less confident that all his students can follow the teaching and learning activities. Although the strategies he prepared should have been followed by his students, because this Emergency remote teaching was carried out by each student and without full control from the teacher, therefore he became less convinced that all his students could follow the learning in the classroom.

Besides, from the second participants the novice teachers, she assumed that she was not sure about her Emergency remote teaching, because there were so many problems that had to be faced when learning Emergency remote teaching that had never been done before. Since she is a teacher she had to give whatever is best for her students during Emergency remote teaching, she also believes that if she focused on students' motivation in Emergency remote teaching, her students will be excited and still follow all the teaching and learning processes in Emergency remote teaching even though some are still ineffective.

Belief of novice teacher during the Emergency remote teaching process is that the most important thing is that all her students can follow all the teaching and learning processes. And for the material, the strategy must all adjust, the most important thing is the student's readiness in learning, she who follows the background and all the problems that students face. Therefore, she focused on paying attention to student motivation online because she believes that if students have the enthusiasm to conduct the teaching and learning process during online classes, they will run.

To what extent does experienced teacher in developing Emergency remote teaching take effect to students?

To answer research questions number two that is "To what extent does Experienced teacher in developing Emergency remote teaching take effect to students?" the data were collected through

the interview. And the researchers finding out the development that experienced teacher's applied in Emergency remote teaching need to be explained.

Firstly, in developing the emergency class the experienced teacher pays great attention to the preparation process before carrying out the teaching and learning process, because the experienced teacher assumes that from careful and good preparation will make the effectiveness of learning increase and students will be easier to understand the material and they tend to be more active to follow the learning to activities. In addition, experienced teacher also explained in detail from the first thing he prepared the material as simple as possible so that it was easily understood by students so that all students paid good attention to their learning. Furthermore, during the process of delivering the teaching material that the media used must also be well thought out for the delivery of the material. Some of the media used during emergency remote teaching, what is noticed from the interview is the background of students and their ability to use learning media. The experienced teacher also added that if one media does not match the student's ability in the sense of experiencing challenges such as unstable networks and so on, and the student cannot follow the learning process, he will use other media as a substitute, the most important thing that students can follow the learning well.

Secondly, for experienced teacher, Emergency remote teaching are a new thing that has never been done before, in the fact that he has some challenges in emergency remote teaching. He experienced confusion and felt surprised by the Emergency remote teaching process that had never been done before due to the unclearness of how the procedures should be carried out during Emergency remote teaching, how the teaching and learning process is good for students and how to prepare before teaching through Emergency remote teaching, in addition to the problem of the difficulty of ascertaining whether all students can take classes properly, in this Emergency remote teaching that requires all students to learn through the internet which requires an internet network. The most common difficulty found is that when he must to make sure the material he gave, the preparation he prepares for learning can be learned by students to the maximum, students can understand well so that all the students he teaches also will be able to follow his classes well. And the last problem he often encounters during online learning that he mentions is the motivation for students to learn. Students tend to be less motivated during online learning, because they learn through gadgets and are required to learn independently from home and not to meet their friends in class which reduces students' enthusiasm and motivation.

Thirdly, on condition that the experienced teacher faced the challenges the he also need some strategy in solving challenges. The experienced teacher is highly concerned about preparing what is needed before teaching and learning activities are carried out. With careful preparation, he believes that this is one of the good strategies to deal with problems in Emergency remote teaching. On the other hand, if the materials and strategies he prepares are interesting and appropriate for their students, they will become more interactive even in Emergency remote teaching. Moreover, the experienced teacher have to aware of several platforms that could be used to develop learning in the Emergency remote teaching. In his experience teaching through the online, there are several platforms that he uses including, there are online meeting platforms Zoom Meetings and Google Meeting, there are also several other supporting platforms such as Google Form, WhatsApp groups, and also YouTube. He used several applications to support the learning he gave to his students was acceptable and maximal. Furthermore, in ensuring that all his students followed his classes properly by contacting their respective homeroom teachers. Before class started he would contact the homeroom teacher first to urge all his students to enter the classroom. In this case, contacting the homeroom teacher is one effective way to make students more aware of the class

they are going to carry out, especially during Emergency remote teaching because students tend to be more difficult to enter the classroom than face-to-face class, also it also can affect in overcome students that unmotivated.

Fourthly, in distinction to the experienced teacher's classroom development, challenges and strategy, the effectiveness to students also have further explanation. From the emergency remote teaching development, the strategy of him using Zoom Meeting as a platform or learning application is used. For the use of this application, it is considered highly effective because it has complete features and makes it easier for students to learn teaching and learning activities through online, in case students do not need to use other applications during learning because all the features are in the Zoom Meeting application. On the other hand, the use of the application is highly effective because of easy access and many students' awareness of the assignments' distribution and they do not just collect their assignments. the effectiveness of students is obvious because from the simple and interesting presentation of the material makes them more enthusiastic in learning, they become more enthusiastic to read the material that has been prepared and for sure they can follow the learning series from beginning to end even though it is online. Therefore, this effectiveness can be seen from every student who takes part in the evaluation and their tasks are all able to understand the mater he has given.

To what extent does novice teacher in developing Emergency remote teaching take effect on students?

To answer research question number three that is "To what extent does Novice teacher developing Emergency remote teaching take effect on students?" the data were gathered through the interview. And the researchers found out that the development that novice teachers applied in Emergency remote teaching needs to be explained.

Firstly, in developing the emergency class the novice teacher showed the same attitude as previously in terms of developing their Emergency remote teaching classes. She stated that the thing that needs to be prioritized in developing Emergency remote teaching is preparation before the class starts, such as preparing platforms or media that will be used for learning and also the material to be taught. The novice teacher also often provides material in the form of photos so that her students can easily access it, and so that the material she provides is easier to understand, she explained the material through a voice note feature on WhatsApp. She also mentioned that sometimes she used learning videos from YouTube as an addition to make her class more interesting.

Secondly, novice teachers also often faced several problems when carrying out online teaching and learning activities. The novice teacher explained that Emergency remote teaching has positive and negative sides, where it becomes a problem because students have different backgrounds. Different backgrounds such as differences in facilities, and differences in students' areas of residence will affect network signals, and these differences affected teaching and learning online, the difficulty of networking hampered the process during Emergency remote teaching activities. Students will find it difficult to attend classes due to incomplete delivery because of network limitations, she also added that to weld material in Emergency remote teaching is also difficult because unstable networks are not as easy as when classes are offline where they usually explain the material through the whiteboard while online must use a platform that requires a stable internet connection. Moreover, students' motivation during Emergency remote teaching was a problem for the novice teacher while teaching. In fact that students become less excited about attending classes and the result is less of them become unmotivated to participate in teaching and

learning. In addition, the limitations of online learning make it confusing for her to give some games to refresh students' thinking, therefore he rarely gives special games or interactions during Emergency remote teaching because it is also one of the problems that the novice teacher faced.

Thirdly, on the condition that the novice teacher faced the challenges she also has her preparation or strategy to overcome problems in the development of Emergency remote teaching. The strategy she maintained for the challenges she faced when developing her first Emergency remote teaching was to motivate students so that they could take the class well, basically, she would always give her students motivation and consequences if they did not follow the class well. Therefore, according to her, the strategy she does affects her students so that they follow their classes well and the development of the classes she does will also affect all of her students. In addition, the media supports developing her class by providing modules to her students so that they have teaching materials, but the content of the modules is also very simple so that students can understand them easily. And other supportive platforms or applications that she also uses to give assignments in google forms, so that students can easily collect them and that there is no cheating of students who see other friends' assignments, instead she chooses to use google forms. This meant that the strategy she used also referred to the material she provided, where she made the learning material so simple to enable students easily understand what she was teaching them because for her the most important thing was that all her students understood what she said during class

Fourthly, this section focused on the effectiveness of the strategies that novice teachers used in Emergency remote teaching against students. The strategy of contacting the homeroom teacher became effective because students became more aware and they became more enthusiastic about participating in teaching and learning activities. Because, according to her, the motivation given by the homeroom teacher is more influential and makes students more aware of learning. Moreover, a line with the material she presented made it as simple and attractive as possible, and this greatly affected her students. The effectiveness can be seen from how they follow the learning with more enthusiasm because they feel that the material presented is easier to understand and they become more interactive and there is the courage to ask questions about the material that has been given.

Discussions

The researchers found that the first result of this study was to find out the first research question: “What are teachers’ beliefs in developing Emergency remote teaching?” The researchers analyzed the data from the semi-structured interview that consider about 8 questions. The interview was carried out with two participants who teach English such as experienced and novice teachers in one of the senior high schools in Tasikmalaya. Based on the result, the researchers analyzed teachers’ beliefs of experienced and novice teachers are different and this will affect the development of Emergency remote teaching from each teacher's beliefs. On the other hand, the results of the interviews with the two participants, and the teachers’ beliefs will greatly influence the development of the Emergency remote teaching they carry out. Based on the research from Larenas, et al, (2015, p.172) explains that beliefs guide their behavioral patterns and advise their practice by acting as an interpretive framework through which they understand what they do in their classrooms. From the statement that experienced teacher said, the most important thing in carrying out online teaching and learning activities is the strategies, and how to prepare a more effective way of delivering material through existing technology it’s easy to understand and all students can access it easily and also the teaching materials he prepared in a simple and interesting

form as well. A line with his participant's statement, Murgatord, (2020) as cited in Ali, (2020, p.19) argues that not only should strategies be designed for unique settings, but it is also important to recognize that technical decisions will be influenced in ways that reflect existing differences, alliances, discourses, and orientations in certain institutions. From the novice teacher, the researchers found that the thing he believed in developing Emergency remote teaching was to follow the background of her students, the most important thing is that all her students can follow all the teaching and learning processes. The beliefs of the novice teacher are also supported by the theory from Zacharias, (2003, p. 9) defines a belief system that contains all of the beliefs they have obtained through the form of cultural transmission. The researchers can conclude that experienced and novice teachers' beliefs, each of them has an important role, each of which has different beliefs but both still had a great influence on students during Emergency remote teaching. Therefore, from experienced and novice, it is also clear that experienced teachers have a more mature preparation in carrying out Emergency remote teaching, and it can be seen from how the preparations are carried out and how to overcome the problems faced. A line with the theory from Melnick & Meister (2008, P. 46) explained that experienced teachers have more value because they tend to be easier to control in the classroom, easier to engage students, and can also complete various problems in the classroom during the teaching and learning process.

The second result, found in this study answers the second research question: "To what extent does an experienced teacher in developing Emergency remote teaching take affect students?" The researchers have data from the interview with an Experienced English senior high school teacher. From the interview, the researchers found out that there was some effectiveness in the emergency remote teaching development strategy that both participants implemented. In the application of Emergency remote teaching, Saadati et al., (2021) stated that ICT integration in the teaching practices implicates the level of teaching and learning using ICT and teachers beliefs of pedagogical-technological beliefs that have a role and they are the central factor. In this regard, the researchers found that the development of emergency remote teaching by experienced teachers using supporting platforms or applications, the second is the use of simple and interesting material, and last is the use of Google Forms for the collection of students' final projects. The researchers found above, it is also supported by the statement of (Cahyadi et al., 2021) stating that implementing Emergency remote teaching in Indonesia, getting progressively delivery available to as many people as possible is referred to as accessibility. Several challenges experienced teachers feel apart from being surprised by the Emergency remote teaching process that had never been done before. Due to the unclearness of how the procedures should be carried out during Emergency remote teaching, ensuring that all students can follow their classes properly from beginning to end without experiencing problems, in the use of the learning application or internet connection problems. As Nugroho & Haghegh, (2021, p.67) stated, both teachers and students have been discovered to face some difficulties during emergency remote teachings, such as a lack of motivation, a lack of creative pedagogical approaches, limited internet connectivity, and difficulty in constructing appropriate materials.

The third result of this study is to find the answer to the third research question: "To what extent do Novice teachers developing Emergency remote teaching take affect students? The researchers have data from the interview with Novice English senior high school teacher in Tasikmalaya. The next result that the researchers found was the emergency remote teaching development strategy that novice teachers applied effectively to the students they taught. The Novice teacher maintained students' motivation by contacting students' homeroom teacher first in case they could take the class well, therefore the strategy affect students the result they follow the

classes well and the development of the classes she does also affect all her students, in fact, the student also became more aware enthusiastic in participating teaching and learning activities. Another strategy for novice teachers is providing modules to students so that they have teaching materials and discussed in WhatsApp groups, it affected students in the fact that student has easy access to WhatsApp accordingly they attend the class and follow the class even better, also another chance to learn more about the materials by themselves. Besides, the Novice teacher used also referred to the material she provided, where the novice teacher made the learning material so simple. As consequence, students could learn easily what he was teaching them, and for the reason, the student needs to understand what she teaching during the class. From the forms of strategies described by novice teachers above, it shows that the development of Emergency remote teaching experiences various problems but participants as teachers can coordinate and overcome these problems well for the smooth teaching and learning process in Emergency remote teaching. Therefore, even though the novice teacher does not use various platforms in teaching in learning activities Compared to novice teachers, experienced teachers had significantly higher overall self-efficacy (Hoekstra et al., 2007).

CONCLUSION

The evolution can impact the progress of Information Communication and Technology (ICT) and the constant evolution that comes with its exploding potential, technology integration in education continues to receive special attention. It is related to the education process, conventional or face-to-face techniques now have shifted to online teaching due to the non-natural COVID-19 disaster. The teachers' beliefs included one of the important things that need to be uncovered before development can occur in Emergency Remote Teaching. Therefore, this research focused on teachers' beliefs in developing Emergency Remote Teaching, it investigates to the beliefs that teachers applied in their teaching and learning activities. The result of this study shows that teachers' beliefs are highly affected by how teachers develop their emergency remote teaching during a pandemic, in addition, teachers' beliefs will greatly influence the development of the Emergency Remote Teaching they carry out. Obviously, depends on both teachers teaching experiences, yet each of them has an important role, each of which has different beliefs but both still had a great influence on students during Emergency Remote Teaching. A line with the result of the study, the effectiveness of the application of strategies in developing emergency remote teaching by experienced teachers results in having effectiveness for students, because, in addition to being able to take advantage of various applications or diverse learning platforms, it is also able to increase student motivation and ability in the field of ICT or technology. On the other hand, the forms of strategies described by novice teachers showed that the development of Emergency Remote Teaching experienced various problems but participants as teachers can coordinate and overcome these problems well for the smooth teaching and learning process in Emergency Remote Teaching.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The researchers would like to thank the English Education Study Program, the participants experienced, and novice teachers in one of the senior high schools in Tasikmalaya who have supported and assisted in providing data and information for this research. The researchers also would like to thank the first and second supervisors who have helped, corrected, and provided input in completing this research.

REFERENCES

Ali, W. (2020). Online and Remote Learning in Higher Education Institutes: A Necessity in light of COVID-19 Pandemic. *Higher Education Studies*, *10*(3), 16. https://doi.org/10.5539/hes.v10n3p16

Bai, B., & Yuan, R. (2019). *E*FL teachers ' beliefs and practices about pronunciation teaching. *Cornell University Library 73*(April), 134–143. https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/ccy040

Cahyadi, A., Hendryadi, Widyastuti, S., Mufidah, V. N., & Achmadi. (2021). Emergency remote teaching evaluation of the higher education in Indonesia. *Heliyon*, *7*(8). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e07788

Caspersen, J., & Raaen, F. D. (2017). theory and practice Novice teachers and how they cope. *Teachers and Teaching, 20(2),* 189-211. https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2013.848570

Creswell, J. W. (2009). Research Design: Qualitative Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches. 3rd (eds). *SAGE Publications Research design* (173-198). ISBN 978-1-4129-6556-9.

Creswell, J.W., & Poth, C.N. (2018). Qualitative Inquiry Research Design Choosing Among Five Approaches. *SAGE Publications Edition, F.* (4n.d.). ISBN 978-1-5063-3020-4

Fraenkel, J. R., Wallen, N. E., & Hyun, H. H. (2012). How to design and evaluate research in education. *New York: McGraw-Hill* (Vol. 7, p. 429). retrieved from EDU 7901 Data Definitions.pdf (johnlpryor.com)

Hoekstra, A., Beijaard, D., Brekelmans, M., & Korthagen, F. (2007). Experienced teachers' informal learning from classroom teaching. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, *13*(2), 191–208. https://doi.org/10.1080/13540600601152546

Jimoyiannis, A., Koukis, N., & Tsiotakis, P. (2021). Shifting to Emergency Remote Teaching Due to the COVID-19 Pandemic: An Investigation of Greek Teachers' Beliefs and Experiences. *Communications in Computer and Information Science*, *1384*, 320–329. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-73988-1_25

Kim, S. L. (2021). A review of the literature on teachers' beliefs about English language learners. *International Journal of Educational Research Open*, *2*, 100040. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedro.2021.100040

Lan, W., & Lam, R. (2020). Language Teaching Research Exploring an EFL Teacher's s Beliefs and Practices in Teaching Topical Debates in Mainland China. *Iranian Journal of Language Teaching Research*, *8*(1), 25–44

Larenas, C.D., Hernandez, P.A., & Navarrete, M.O. (2015). Case Study on EFL Teachers ' Beliefs About the Teaching and Learning of English in Public. P*orta linguaruM*, 23(5). 171–186.

Melnick, S. a, & Meister, D. G. (2008). A Comparison of Beginning and Experienced Teachers' Concerns. *Educational Research Quarterly*, *31*(3), 40–56.

Nugroho, A., & Haghegh, M. (2021). Emergency Remote Teaching amidst Global Pandemic: Voices of Indonesian EFL Teachers. *VELES Voices of English Language Education Society*, *5*(1), 66–80. https://doi.org/10.29408/veles.v5i1.3258

Nurkamto, J., Drajati, N. A., & Karlina, Y. (2021). Teachers ' beliefs and practices in teaching reading at Islamic secondary schools in Indonesia. *Indonesian journal of applied linguistics*, *10*(3), 667–676. https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v10i3.31753

Roeder, R. V, & Miller, E. R. (2022). Grammar in Communicative Language Teaching. *International Journal of English Language Teaching, 8(4),* 45-64

Saadati, F., Giaconi, V., Chandia, E., Fuenzalida, N., & Donoso, M. R. (2021). Beliefs and Practices About Remote Teaching Processes During the Pandemic: A Study with Chilean

Mathematics Teachers. *Eurasia Journal of Mathematics, Science and Technology Education*, *17*(11), 1–15. https://doi.org/10.29333/ejmste/11201

Smith., Joanna., Firth., & Jill, (2011). Qualitative Data Analysis: the Framework Approach. *University of Huddersfield Repository Nurse Researcher, 18(2),* 52-62. retrieved from http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/id/eprint/18884/

Zacharias, N. T. (2003). A survey of tertiary teachers' beliefs about English language teaching in Indonesia about the role of English as a global language. *Unpublished MA Thesis, Thailand University*, *August*, *126*. Retrieved from https://asian-efl-journal.com/thesis_N_Zacharias.pdf

Zhang, C. (2020). From Face-to-Face to Screen-to-Screen: CFL Teachers' Beliefs about Digital Teaching Competence during the Pandemic. *International Journal of Chinese Language Teaching*, *1*, 35–52. https://doi.org/10.46451/ijclt.2020.06.03